



Architectural Preservation Studio, DPC
Architecture, Historic Preservation, & Building Envelope Consulting



740 Broadway, Suite 1001, New York, NY 10003
212.477.7976 / www.preservationstudio.com

January 31, 2019

Peter Bamberry, RA, NCARB
Special Projects Coordinator
Town of East Greenwich, DPW
P.O. Box 111
East Greenwich, RI 02818

**Re: East Greenwich Town Hall – Roofing Restoration
Bid Analysis**

Dear Peter:

Architectural Preservation Studio, DPC (APS) has reviewed the bids received for the above referenced project. Bids were received on January 23, 2019 from five of the six contractors who attended the mandatory prebid meeting for the project: Alden Bailey Restoration Corp., Apollo Roofing & Sheetmetal, LLC, Crocker Architectural Sheet Metal Co, Inc., Martone Services Company, Inc., and Titan Roofing, Inc..

The five bids received for the project were:

- Alden Bailey: Grand Total: \$438,010.00
- Apollo: Grand Total: \$651,000.00
- Crocker: Grand Total: \$594,900.00
- Martone: Grand Total: \$819,895.00
- Titan: Grand Total: \$806,000.00

APS has checked the accuracy of the values provided in each bid and the numbers are all accurate (see attached spreadsheet).

- Alden Bailey is the lowest bidder, and their bid is close to our estimate for the project of \$450,000. APS reviewed the scope of work for the project with Alden Bailey and they have a clear understanding of the project and are comfortable with their bid price. We also attended the interview with Alden Bailey and the Town on February 30, 2019. They had positive answers to the questions posed by the Town regarding scope, means and methods and pricing. APS has worked with Alden Bailey on a number of similar slate roofing projects and they are an exceptional contractor that performs excellent quality work.
- Crocker's bid falls in-between the lowest and higher bidders. Their bid breakdown does not contain any anomalies or out-of-field numbers they are just higher for their slate pricing and have included replacing all of the gutters and downspouts in their base bid. APS has also work with Crocker on five historic roofing projects. They are excellent contractors who also produce exceptional quality work. Their bid is just higher than Alden Bailey on this particular project.
- Apollo, Martone and Titan's numbers are very high across the board especially for General Conditions.

Based on the above, APS recommends awarding the project to Alden Bailey. They are a high quality contractor with extensive experience performing projects of a similar scope and size and their bid price falls within the anticipated budget.

Please let me know if you need more information.

Very Truly Yours,
ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION STUDIO, DPC

Carl Rothbart, Assoc. AIA
Partner

BID ANALYSIS

Project: P08-001 East Greenwich Town Hall Roofing Restoration
125 Main Street, East Greenwich, RI

Architect: Architectural Preservation Studio, DPC
58 Pine Street
New Canaan, CT 06840

Issued: January 25, 2019

A - Base Bid:		Alden-Bailey	Apollo	Crocker	Martone	Titan
General Conditions						
1) Install Scaffolding/lifts, bridging and fencing where required to perform the scope of work and to protect the public during the construction process.		\$29,600	\$103,000	\$80,000	\$75,750	\$90,000
2) Provide all General Conditions and temporary facilities.		\$4,800	\$43,000	\$10,000	\$168,095	\$50,000
GENERAL CONDITIONS LUMP SUM SUBTOTAL		\$34,400.00	\$146,000.00	\$90,000.00	\$243,845.00	\$140,000.00
Roofing Repairs						
1) Remove/replace slate main roofing system		\$199,820	\$146,000	\$324,900	\$369,800	\$385,000
2) Remove/replace dormer slate roofing		\$15,040	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$14,000	\$24,000
3) Install all new copper flashing systems		\$39,850	\$78,000	\$10,000	\$52,000	\$90,000
4) Remove/reinstall existing gutter systems		\$13,600	\$11,000	\$10,000	\$24,000	\$10,000
5) Install 3 pipe snow guard system		\$21,080	\$24,000	\$30,000	\$21,000	\$24,000
6) Remove/repair/reinstall existing rooftop railing/balustrade providing new railing flashing pockets		\$12,700	\$30,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$35,000
7) Remove/repair/reinstall existing low and high wood cornices providing new flashing below		\$6,600	\$26,000	\$7,500	\$7,500	\$10,000
8) Repair all damaged exterior woodwork in roof replacement areas		\$28,010	\$120,000	\$10,000	\$5,000	\$15,000
9) Remove/replace sealant at dormer, lower and cupola window perimeters		\$3,700	\$3,000	\$10,000	\$2,000	\$5,000
10) Repoint open joints and replace deteriorated brickwork at chimney		\$8,650	\$11,000	\$10,000	\$6,750	\$8,000
11) Repair damaged attic roof framing and beam insulation		\$5,600	in allowance	\$10,000	\$15,500	\$10,000
ROOFING REPAIRS LUMP SUM SUBTOTAL		\$354,850.00	\$459,000.00	\$454,900.00	\$527,550.00	\$616,000.00
BASE BID SUBTOTAL		\$389,250.00	\$605,000.00	\$544,900.00	\$771,395.00	\$756,000.00
Cost of Payment Bond		\$4,380	\$6,000	\$5,000	\$4,250	\$5,000
Cost of Performance Bond		\$4,380	inc. above	\$5,000	\$4,250	\$5,000
Wood Structure/Decking Replacement Allowance		\$15,000	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$15,000
Gutter, Downspout Repair/Replacement Allowance		\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$5,000
Exterior Woodwork Repair/Replacement Allowance		\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000
Railing Repair/Replacement Allowance		\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000
LUMP SUMS SUBTOTAL		\$48,760.00	\$46,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$48,500.00	\$50,000.00
GRAND TOTAL		\$438,010.00	\$651,000.00	\$594,900.00	\$819,895.00	\$806,000.00
Alternates						
1) Replace all existing gutters and downspouts with new heavy duty copper units		\$24,880	\$30,000	\$0	\$39,200	\$42,000
2) Install new wood clapboard in lieu of copper siding at dormers		-\$5,100	\$19,000	\$0	-\$25,000	-\$3,500
Unit Price Items - Additional Work						
1) Repoint additional brickwork (per square foot)		\$14.00	\$102.00	\$45.00	\$50.00	\$75.00
2) Existing sealant replacement (per linear foot)		\$8.00	\$10.00	\$9.00	\$23.00	\$18.00
3) Replace additional gutters (per linear foot)		\$45.00	\$86.00	\$0.00	\$172.50	\$90.00
4) Repair additional downspouts (per linear foot)		\$35.00	\$58.00	\$0.00	\$51.75	\$75.00
Change Order Work						
General Conditions – General Contractor		10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
General Conditions – Sub Contractor		10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
Overhead & Profit – General Contractor		15%	15%	15%	15%	15%
Overhead & Profit – Sub Contractor		10%	10%	10%	10%	10%
NOTES		Subcontract: None	Subcontract: Staging, Masonry, Painting	Subcontract: None	Subcontract: Roofing, Masonry, Abatement	Subcontract: None listed